

Chapter 19

THE REVIEW PROCESS

A review of this nature and of this detail has been a learning experience for all involved. It would be a reasonable summary observation to say that no one was entirely happy with the process or the results.

An exercise of such expectations was destined to disappoint some, if not all. That participation was maintained is perhaps the best measure of this review, in that all concerned wanted it to work.

A significant element of the review has been the REVIEW OF THE REVIEW:

- Preliminary results were discussed with the participants and independent colleagues at workshops in
 - February 1999, and
 - March 2000
- Preliminary versions of the present report were prepared in
 - May 2000, and
 - October 2000
- Written comment on the October 2000 draft was completed by April 2001.
- There was a final meeting of the review panel in April 2001, prior to the completion of this report.

The predictions for schematic applications H1 through H11 (hydrodynamics) and M1 through M4 (mass transport) were analyzed in considerable detail. Each of the schematic applications was intended to exercise a particular aspect of model performance. In some case, the intention was to stretch the performance envelopes of the participant models, to establish both the range of applicability and the limits of applicability. Such is the complexity of both the participant codes and the schematic applications that “problems” were inevitable, be they

- in interpretation of the schematic applications,

- in interpretation of the predictions, or
- implicit in the codes.

The detail in the review was more than matched by the detail in the review of the review - by independent colleagues and especially by the participants themselves. Not one vaguely negative comment was left unchallenged. In retrospect, these detailed exchanges of interpretations were the most valuable aspects of the entire review process. Much of the discussion would not have come to light without the initial insistence on both the physical and numerical detail. The overall result can not be dismissed as cursory.